### CULTURALLY RESPONSIVE TEACHING

Theory, Research, and Practice

GENEVA GAY

FOREWORD BY JAMES A. BANKS



Teachers College, Columbia University
New York and London

schools. Negotiating both ways of being can be stress-provoking and emotionally exhausting; it can even cause some students to drop out of the academic loop entirely. Others may sacrifice their friendship networks and ethnic connections for school success. Neither of these choices is desirable for the students involved, nor does either offer the best conditions for maximum achievement of any kind. Students should be able to achieve academically, ethnically, culturally, and socially simultaneously without any of these abilities interfering with the others.

#### CONCLUSION

Much intellectual ability and many other kinds of intelligences are lying untapped in ethnically diverse students. If these are recognized and used in the instructional process, school achievement will improve radically. Culturally responsive teaching is a means for unleashing the higher learning potentials of ethnically diverse students by simultaneously cultivating their academic and psychosocial abilities.

The best-quality educational programs and practices can never be accomplished if some ethnic groups and their contributions to the development of U.S. history, life, and culture are ignored or demeaned. All schools and teachers, regardless of the ethnic and racial makeup of their local student populations, must be actively involved in promoting equity and excellence, and all students must be benefactors of these efforts. Education that is minimally adequate has to teach students the knowledge, values, and skills they need to function effectively as citizens of the pluralistic U.S. society. These are requirements, not voluntary choices, for all students.

Despite an increasingly diverse population, most people in the United States live in communities with others more alike than different from themselves. Students from these communities arrive at school knowing little of significance about people who are different. Yet their lives are intertwined with these "unknown others" and will become even more so in the future. If we are to avoid intergroup strife and individuals are to live the best-quality lives possible, we simply must teach students how to relate better with people from different ethnic, racial, cultural, language, and gender backgrounds. These *relational competencies* must encompass knowing, valuing, doing, caring, and sharing power, resources, and responsibilities. Hence, developing sociocivic skills for effective membership in multicultural communities is as important a goal of culturally responsive pedagogy as improving the academic achievement and personal development of students of color.

#### CHAPTER 2

### Power Pedagogy Through Cultural Responsiveness

Teaching is a contextual and situational process. As such, it is most effective when ecological factors, such as prior experiences, community settings, cultural backgrounds, and ethnic identities of teachers and students, are included in its implementation. This basic fact is often ignored in teaching some Native, Latino, African, and Asian American students, especially if they are poor. Instead, they are taught from the middle class, Eurocentric frameworks that shape school practices. This attitude of "cultural blindness" stems from several sources.

adapt to U. S. society. The best way to facilitate this process is for all origin. These students need to forget about being different and learn to diverse cultural heritages, ethnic groups, social classes, and points of students to have the same experiences in schools. effective doorway of assimilation into mainstream society for people from under all circumstances. Fifth, there is the claim that education is an and they mistakenly believe that to treat students differently because of about how teaching practices reflect European American cultural values. cultural diversity. Second, too few teachers have adequate knowledge of academic excellence, rather than wasting time on fanciful notions about edge and skills that they can apply in life, and how to meet high standards civic skills. Students, especially underachieving ones, need to learn knowlthat good teaching is transcendent; it is identical for all students and their cultural orientations is racial discrimination. Fourth, there is a belief groups. Third, most teachers want to do the best for all their students, Nor are they sufficiently informed about the cultures of different ethnic cultures and heritages. It is about teaching intellectual, vocational, and One of these is the notion that education has nothing to do with

#### INTRODUCTION

This chapter calls these assumptions into question. It begins by exposing the fallacy of cultural neutrality and the homogeneity syndrome in teach-

ing and learning for Native, African, Latino, and Asian American students who are not performing very well on traditional measures of school achievement. It also debunks the notion that school success for students of color can be generated from negative perceptions of their life experiences, cultural backgrounds, and intellectual capabilities. Instead, instructional reforms are needed that are grounded in positive beliefs about the cultural heritages and academic potentialities of these students. A pedagogical paradigm that has these characteristics is presented. The conceptual explication of this paradigm includes a brief historical background, descriptive characteristics, two case examples of its theoretical principles exemplified in practice, and some suggestions for how teachers can begin their transformation toward greater cultural responsiveness in working with students of color.

#### FROM CAN'T TO CAN

determined and are not the same for all ethnic groups. The structures, everywhere." Individuals who subscribe to this belief fail to realize that gender, ethnicity, or culture of students and teachers. This attitude is classrooms. Students are expected to pay close attention to teachers for prolonged, largely uninterrupted periods of time. Specific signs and sigassumptions, substance, and operations of conventional educational entertheir standards of "goodness" in teaching and learning are culturally manifested in the expression "Good teachers anywhere are good teachers time, and context. They contend it has nothing to do with the class, race, Many educators still believe that good teaching transcends place, people, prises are European American cultural icons (Pai, 1990). A case in point and/or engaging in off-task behaviors. All these are "read" as obstructive are judged to be uninvolved, distracted, having short attention spans, times, at intervals, and for durations designated by teachers, the students contact, and body posture. When they are not exhibited by learners at iors. These include nonverbal communication cues, such as gaze, eye nals have evolved that are associated with appropriate attending behavis the protocols of attentiveness and the emphasis placed on them in to effective teaching and learning.

Many students are admonished by teachers to "Look at me when I'm talking to you." Direct eye contact as a signal of attentiveness may be perceived as staring, a cultural taboo that causes resentment among some Apache students (Spring, 1995). Other discontinuities in behavioral norms and expectations are not isolated incidents or rare occurrences in culturally pluralistic classrooms. They happen often and on many different fronts,

simply because teachers fail to recognize, understand, or appreciate the pervasive influence of culture on their own and their students' attitudes, values, and behaviors.

Decontextualizing teaching and learning from the ethnicities and cultures of students minimizes the chances that their achievement potential will ever be fully realized. Pai (1990) agrees with this assertion and makes the point even more emphatically, explaining:

Our goals, how we teach, what we teach, how we relate to children and each other are rooted in the norms of our culture. Our society's predominant worldview and cultural norms are so deeply ingrained in how we educate children that we seldom think about the possibility that there may be other different but equally legitimate and effective approaches to teaching and learning. In a society with as much sociocultural and racial diversity as the United States, the lack of this wonderment about alternative ways often results in unequal education and social injustice. (p. 229)

ously, too many teachers plead ignorance of Latinos, African Americans, very thing they are most concern about—that is, students' individuality. socialization. Teachers need to understand very thoroughly both the relaality of students is deeply entwined with their ethnic identity and cultural seductive temptation to turn others into images of ourselves. The individuin effective teaching, not race, ethnicity, culture, or gender." Simultaneity, culture, and ethnicity are not synonymous. different students, insult their cultural heritages, or ignore them entirely tionships and the distinctions between these to avoid compromising the is inconceivable how educators can recognize and nurture the individualgood teaching is devoid of cultural tenets is the frequent declaration that filters through which one's individuality is made manifest. Yet individual-In the instructional process. In reality, ethnicity and culture are significant increases the risk that teachers will impose their notions on ethnically Inability to make distinctions among ethnicity, culture, and individuality from ourselves often breeds negative attitudes, anxiety, fears, and the ity of students if they do not know them. Ignorance of people different Native Americans, Laotians, Vietnamese, and other immigrant groups. It respecting the individual differences of students is really what counts Another common and paradoxical manifestation of the notion that

The second troubling feature of the conventional educational ethos and practices with respect to improving the achievement of ethnically diverse students is the "deficit syndrome." Far too many educators attribute school failure to what students of color don't have and can't do. Some of the specific reasons given for why Navajo students do poorly in school are representative of this kind of thinking. In a school district in

25

which 48% of the students are Navajo, and one of every four Navajos leave before graduation, the causes of school failure identified by the administrators were all "deficits." Among them were lack of self-esteem; inadequate homes and prior preparation; poor parenting skills and low parental participation in the schooling process; lack of language development; poor academic interests, aspirations, and motivation; few opportunities for cultural enrichment; high truancy and absentee rates; and health problems, such as fetal alcohol syndrome (Deyhle, 1995). Except for fetal alcohol syndrome, similar "deficits" have been attributed to underachieving Latinos, African Americans, and some groups of Asian Americans.

being, dropout prevention, and avoidance of discipline problems. achievement possibilities—academic, school attendance, personal welland "cumulative failure" are devastating to many different kinds of can't do it" (p. 152, emphasis in original). This "learned helplessness" "each new failure confirms what they already 'know' about the task—they students meet with consistent failure in performing a particular task, they will have little confidence in their ability to succeed . . . in the future," and ceeded at that task or similar ones in the past" (p. 151). Conversely, "when more confident that they can succeed at a task ... when they have suc-(1995) refers to this as having self-efficacy, meaning that "students feel a basis of strength and capability, not weakness and failure. Ormrod personal confidence and courage. In other words, learning derives from requires students to have some degree of academic mastery, as well as high-risk venture. To pursue it with conviction, and eventual competence, of even greater complexity (Ormrod, 1995). High-level learning is a very Mastery of tasks at one level encourages individuals to accomplish tasks courage does not stem from cowardice. Instead, success begets success. does not emerge out of failure, weakness does not generate strength, and sounds more like a basis for "correcting or curing" than educating. Success Trying to teach from this "blaming the victim" and deficit mindset

Therefore, a very different pedagogical paradigm is needed to improve the performance of underachieving students from various ethnic groups—one that teaches to and through their personal and cultural strengths, their intellectual capabilities, and their prior accomplishments. Culturally responsive teaching is this kind of paradigm. It is at once a routine and a radical proposal. It is routine because it does for Native American, Latino, Asian American, African American, and low-income students what traditional instructional ideologies and actions do for middle-class European Americans. That is, it filters curriculum content and teaching strategies through their cultural frames of reference to make the content more personally meaningful and easier to master. It is radical

because it makes explicit the previously implicit role of culture in teaching and learning, and it insists that educational institutions accept the legitimacy and viability of ethnic group cultures in improving learning out-

These are rather commonsensical and obvious directions to take, particularly in view of research evidence and classroom practices that demonstrate that socioculturally centered teaching does enhance student achievement. This is especially true when achievement measures are not restricted solely to academic indicators and standardized test scores. Most of this research and practice have focused on African Americans (for example, Chapman, 1994; Erickson, 1987; M. Foster, 1991, 1994, 1995, 1997; Hollins, 1996; Irvine, 1990; Ladson-Billings, 1992, 1994, 1995a and 1995b, 1995c; Lee, 1993; Lee & Slaughter-Defoe, 1995) and Native Hawaiians (Au, 1993; Au & Kawakami, 1994; Boggs et al., 1985; Cazden et al., 1985; Tharp & Gallimore, 1988).

The close interactions among ethnic identity, cultural background, and student achievement (that is, between culture and cognition) are becoming increasingly apparent. So is the transformative potential of teaching grounded in multicultural contributions, experiences, and orientations. It is these interactions, and related data, that give source and focus, power and direction to the proposal made here for a paradigmatic shift in the pedagogy used with non-middle-class, non-European American students in U.S. schools. This is a call for the widespread implementation of *culturally responsive teaching*.

groups that are not as successful. Nor will children like Amy and Aaron cultural and ethnic integrity or relationships with peers from ethnic or camouflage their academic achievement to avoid compromising their (or any other ethnic group of color) will feel less compelled to sabotage decrease significantly. Academically capable African American students those described by Fordham and Ogbu (1986) and Fordham (1996) may that all this entails is done systematically and effectively, dilemmas like cultural continuity in educating ethnically diverse students. To the extent bent upon teachers, administrators, and evaluators to deliberately create and prior experiences will help to reverse achievement trends. It is incumupon them. Accepting the validity of these students' cultural socialization sonal denigration, educational inequity, and academic underachievement different students, they will persist in imposing cultural hegemony, perthe cultural orientations, values, and performance styles of ethnically memories of school (described in Chapter 1) continue to have such painful experiences and If educators continue to be ignorant of, ignore, impugn, and silence

#### IDEOLOGICAL BEGINNINGS

selves they bring with them into school, and to build on this by demonown cultural attitudes, assumptions, mechanisms, rules, and regulations wherein their cultural differences lie and ... capitalize upon them as a (Abrahams & Troike, 1972, p. 6). strating the social and linguistic and cultural alternatives around them" minority] students than to provide them with a sense of dignity in the This is imperative because there is "no other way of educating . . . [racialthat have made it difficult for them to teach these children successfully denigrating . . . the students" (p. 5). Educators also need to analyze their resource, rather than...disregarding the differences...[and] thereby minority students are to be taught effectively, teachers "must learn continue to prevail. Abrahams and Troike (1972) argued that if racialthat were apparent in learning opportunities and outcomes, and that nated in the early 1970s out of concerns for the racial and ethnic inequities Their persistence is not surprising, since multicultural education origimajor part of education for and about cultural diversity from its inception. The ideas on which culturally responsive teaching are based have been a

assists Asian Americans in transcending the psychological colonization perspectives is one way to make this happen. school achievement. Teaching students of color from their own cultural space" are necessary to facilitate maximum academic and other forms of (Chun-Hoon, 1973, p. 139). Both "intellectual freedom" and "psychic space can be created only between distinct and contrasting points of view" freedom can exist only in the context of psychic space, while psychic als of color and society at large are short-changed, because "intellectual totally silenced. Without these kind of educational interventions, individupromoted by the mass media, which make them virtually invisible and democratic communities by not homogenizing diverse peoples, and it society and Asian Americans. It helps to circumvent dangers to open, schools offers intellectual and psychological benefits for both mainstream Chun-Hoon (1973) suggested that teaching cultural diversity in

gued in 1975 that "educational processes are needed which enable all stand each others' cultures, and to attain higher levels of academic achieveconsistent with cultural origins" (p. 165, emphasis in original), to understudents to become positive contributors to a culturally dynamic society several of them illustrate the similarity of these messages. Arciniega arin shaping the multicultural education movement. Early comments from teaching also permeate the thinking of educators who were instrumental Chun-Hoon about the potentials of using diverse cultural referents in The strong convictions expressed by Abrahams and Troike and by

> stop trying to avoid the realities of ethnic differences and the roles they that they exist and that they affect learning and academic outcomes" differences exist in important dimensions . . . it must be acknowledged play in U. S. education. He reasoned that "since it is a fact that ethnic schools" (Arciniega, 1975, p. 167). Carlson (1976) advised educators to between the cultural lifestyles of ethnic minority students and current pluralistic educational paradigm is "the creative ability to approach probment. One of the most powerful benefits to be derived from a culturally This is what is involved when we talk about eliminating incongruities lem-solving activities with a built-in repertoire of bicultural perspectives

ing in general. He advised: of individuals and groups. Forbes also expressed some ideas about the societies; means of functioning harmoniously with nature and with other nations; personality characteristics valued by particular Native American students, which later became core elements of culturally responsive teach toward others, self-realization, and spiritual and character development context of reciprocal relationships, mutual sharing, showing hospitality different spheres of life. All these skills were to be developed within the people; and ways to achieve the highest levels of mastery possible in skills for the continued survival and development of their tribal groups or decisions. Native American students should be taught knowledge and from them, should be the foundation of all curricular and instructional cultural, religiophilosophical, and political behavioral styles resulting ponents of learning. Forbes suggested that cultural values, and the socioin the focal values of Native American cultures and comprehensive com-Native American students. He outlined an educational agenda centered importance of community building and "success" for Native Americar Forbes (1973) developed this theme further as it relates to teaching

owes his existence and definition of being, to the total web of natural life, to seeks to perfect behavior and skills which will add "beauty" to the world. to the well-being of one's people and all life. This means that the individual develop a realization that "success" in life stems from being able to contribute which he and his people also owe their existence. . . . The individual should from the fact of his belonging to a community of related people in which he To create "beauty" in actions, words, and objects is the overall objective of human beings in the world. (Forbes, 1973, p. 205) The individual should develop a profound conception of the unity of life

ducting business as usual, or using traditional instructional conventions. Instead, they should "respect the cultural and linguistic characteristics of Banks admonished teachers of racial-minority students to stop con-

minority youths, and change the curriculum so that it will reflect their learning and cultural styles and greatly enhance their achievement." Moreover, "minority students should not be taught contempt for their cultures. Teachers should use elements of their cultures to help them attain the skills which they need to live alternative life styles" (J. Banks, 1975, pp. 165–166). Cuban (1972) warned educators to avoid looking for simple, one-dimensional solutions to complex challenges in educating students of color. The mere inclusion of ethnic content into school curricula would not resolve these dilemmas. Some radical changes were needed in the instructional process as well. While ethnic content has the potential to stimulate intellectual curiosity and make meaningful contact with ethnically diverse students, it should be combined with instructional strategies that emphasize inquiry, critique, and analysis, rather than the traditional preferences for rote memory and regurgitation of factual information.

Aragon (1973) shifted the focus of reform needs to teacher preparation. He argued that the reason ethnic minorities were not doing well in school was more a function of teacher limitations than student inabilities. Teachers, rather than students, were "culturally deprived" because they did not understand or value the cultural heritages of minority groups. Educational reform needed to begin by changing teacher attitudes about nonmainstream cultures and ethnic groups, and then developing skills for incorporating cultural diversity into classroom instruction. These changes would lead to improvement in student achievement.

As early as 1975, Gay identified some specific ways to develop multicultural curriculum content and some important dimensions of achievement other than basic skills and academic subjects. Her conceptions of achievement encompassed ethnic identity development, citizenship skills for pluralistic societies, knowledge of ethnic and cultural diversity, and cross-cultural interactional competence as well as academic success. She suggested that content about cultural diversity has both intrinsic and instrumental value for classroom instruction. The instrumental value includes improving interest in and motivation for learning for diverse students, relevance of school learning, and establishing linkages among school, home, and community. Specifically, Gay (1975) suggested:

Ethnic materials should be used to teach such fundamental skills as reading, writing, calculating, and reasoning. Students can learn reading skills using materials written by and about Blacks, Mexican Americans, Italian Americans, and Jewish Americans as well as they can from reading "Dick and Jane." Ethnic literature... can be used to teach plot, climax, metaphor, grammatical structure, and symbolism as well as anything written by Anglo Americans. ... [Teaching] ethnic literacy, reflective self-analysis, decision making, and

social activism... are as essential for living in a culturally and ethnically pluralistic society as are knowing how to read and having a salable skill.
... Ethnic content serves the purpose of bringing academic tasks from the realm of the alien and the abstract into the experiential frames of reference of ethnically different youth. (pp. 179–181)

### DESCRIPTIVE CHARACTERISTICS

Although called by many different names, including culturally relevant, sensitive, centered, congruent, reflective, mediated, contextualized, synchronized, and responsive, the ideas about why it is important to make classroom instruction more consistent with the cultural orientations of ethnically diverse students, and how this can be done, are virtually identical. Hereafter, they are referred to by my term of preference, culturally responsive pedagogy. It represents a compilation of ideas and explanations from a wide variety of scholars. Throughout this discussion, labels other than "culturally responsive" appear only when the scholars quoted directly use different terminology.

### Culturally Responsive Teaching Is Validating

Culturally responsive teaching can be defined as using the cultural knowledge, prior experiences, frames of reference, and performance styles of ethnically diverse students to make learning encounters more relevant to and effective for them. It teaches to and through the strengths of these students. It is culturally validating and affirming. Furthermore, culturally responsive teaching has the following characteristics:

- It acknowledges the legitimacy of the cultural heritages of different ethnic groups, both as legacies that affect students' dispositions, attitudes, and approaches to learning and as worthy content to be taught in the formal curriculum.
- It builds bridges of meaningfulness between home and school experiences as well as between academic abstractions and lived sociocultural realities.
- It uses a wide variety of instructional strategies that are connected to different learning styles.
- It teaches students to know and praise their own and each others' cultural heritages.
- It incorporates multicultural information, resources, and materials in all the subjects and skills routinely taught in schools.

affiliation and understanding, knowledge and skills needed to challenge existing social orders and power structures are desirable goals to be taught proved academic achievement are interactional. Furthermore, the cultural concepts, knowledge of and pride in one's own ethnic identity, and imapproaches to teaching are based on the assumption that positive selfin order to tap into the learning styles of different ethnic students. These competitive and cooperative, active participatory and sedentary activities range of sensory stimuli (visual, tactile, auditory), individual and group, and skills in language arts, social studies, and science can include a wide and consumer habits of different ethnic groups. Opportunities provided for students to practice and demonstrate mastery of information, concepts, economics, architecture, employment patterns, population distributions, statistics) in everyday life can engage students in explorations of the crafts, concepts and operations (such as calculations, pattern, proportionality, and examples from a wide variety of ethnic authors. The study of math Thus, the study of different literary genres is replete with samples

## Culturally Responsive Teaching Is Comprehensive

pendent affair, and manifest it habitually in their expressive behaviors. countable for each others' learning as well as their own. They are expected and the entire modus operandi of the classroom. Students are held acto internalize the value that learning is a communal, reciprocal, interdetogether into an integrated whole that permeates all curriculum content camaraderie, and shared responsibility; and acquire an ethic of success. Expectations and skills are not taught as separate entities but are woven with their ethnic groups and communities; develop a sense of community, mitted to helping students of color maintain identity and connections improving academic achievement, these approaches to teaching are comculturally valued knowledge in curriculum content" (p. 13). Along with ated cognition, culturally appropriate social situations for learning, and designed specifically for students of color incorporates "culturally mediother words, they teach the whole child. Hollins (1996) adds that education tural referents to impart knowledge, skills, and attitudes" (p. 382). In velop intellectual, social, emotional, and political learning by "using cul-Ladson-Billings (1992) explains that culturally responsive teachers de-

Ladson-Billings (1994) observed these values being exemplified in actual instruction in the elementary classrooms she studied. She saw expectations expressed, skills taught, interpersonal relations exhibited, and an overall esprit de corps operating where students were part of a collective effort designed to promote academic and cultural excellence.

They functioned like members of an extended family, assisting, supporting, and encouraging each other. The entire class was expected to rise or fall together, and it was in the best interest of everyone to ensure that each individual member of the group was successful. By building an academic community of learners, the teachers responded to the sense of belonging youths need, honored their human dignity, and promoted their individual self-concepts. Students engaged in caring relationships, shared resources, and worked closely together and with the teacher to attain common learning outcomes. Educational excellence included academic success as well as cultural competence, critical social consciousness, political activism, and responsible community membership. A strong belief in the right of students to be part of a mutually supportive group of high achievers permeated all these learning processes and outcomes (M. Foster, 1995, 1997; Irvine & Foster, 1996; Ladson-Billings, 1995a, 1995b; Lipman, 1995).

# Culturally Responsive Teaching Is Multidimensional

or some combination of these. ethnic protest presented in one expressive form and transfer it to another decide how their performance will be evaluated, whether by written can be achieved across ethnic groups. Students can also help teachers expressions and to see whether any consensus and collaborative action dents to understand the major points made in these different forms of rhetoric, sit-ins, songs, political slogans). Part of the challenge is for stuexpress their positions on the issues of contention in various genre (e.g., meetings can be held in which individuals from different ethnic groups playing various ethnic individuals. Within these simulations, coalition and political actions. The students and teachers may decide to simulate is expressed by different ethnic groups in poetry, song lyrics, paintings, of their respective disciplines, such as how protest against discrimination in teaching the concept of protest. It can be examined from the perspective ple, language arts, music, art, and social studies teachers may collaborate ships, instructional techniques, and performance assessments. For examcontent, learning context, classroom climate, student-teacher relation-Multidimensional culturally responsive teaching encompasses curriculum tests, peer feedback, observations, ability to extrapolate information about time periods when social protest was very prominent, analyzing and role-

To do this kind of teaching well requires tapping into a wide range of cultural knowledge, experiences, contributions, and perspectives. Emotions, beliefs, values, ethos, opinions, and feelings are scrutinized along with factual information to make curriculum and instruction more reflec-

held accountable for knowing, thinking, questioning, analyzing, feeling, reflecting, sharing, and acting. cultural heritages. In the process of accomplishing these goals, students are students clarify their ethnic values while correcting factual errors about ments of cultural socialization that most directly affect learning. It helps that ethnic group. Cultural responsive pedagogy focuses on those eleare the cultures included in the curriculum used only with students from

### Culturally Responsive Teaching Is Empowering

of achievement, and celebrating individual and collective accomplishmorale, providing resources and personal assistance, developing an ethos support the efforts of students so that they will persevere toward high levels of academic achievement. This is done by boostering students' the way to mastery. They plan accordingly and create infrastructures to involved in learning and the need for students to have successes along risk endeavors. Culturally responsive teachers are aware of the risks and commit themselves to making success happen. These can be highis obtained. Teachers must show students that they expect them to succeed in learning tasks and be willing to pursue success relentlessly until mastery the will to act. In other words, students have to believe they can succeed translates into academic competence, personal confidence, courage, and to be better human beings and more successful learners. Empowerment Because culturally responsive teaching is empowering, it enables students

their own learning. They include students' being taught high-level academic skills and how to take ownership of These are social and personal supports that buffer students as they are by what Mehan and associates (1996) call a system of "social scaffolding." ment classes. The accompanying instructional interventions are reinforced African American students are encouraged to enroll in advanced-place-(Swanson et al., 1995; Mehan et al., 1996). Low-achieving Latino and excellent example of how this empowering process operates in practice The Advancement Via Individual Determination (AVID) project is an

- explaining their problem-solving techniques to each other in small
- displaying insignia (e.g., emblems, signs, pins, badges, logos) that identify them as AVID participants,
- spending time together in a space specifically designated for AVID,

- learning the "cultural capital" of school success (test-taking strategies, taking, time management), self-presentation techniques to fit teaching styles, study skills, note-
- being mentored in academic and social skills by other students who have successfully completed the program.

of color, they are nonetheless apropos. He characterizes empowering cerns about improving the school achievement of marginalized students education. Although his explanations do not derive explicitly from coneducation as Shor (1992) elucidates further on the nature and effect of empowering

ership by the teacher, and mutual teacher-student authority. In addition, inequality, and change. . . . The learning process is negotiated, requiring leada critical-democratic pedagogy for self and social change. It is a studentknowledge, habits of inquiry, and critical curiosity about society, power, are to relate personal growth to public life, to develop strong skills, academic because the self and society create each other. . . . The goals of this pedagogy centered program for multicultural democracy in school and society. It apwhile ignoring public welfare. (pp. 15-16) proaches individual growth as an active, cooperative, and social process, ... the empowering class does not teach students to seek self-centered gain

Shor (1992) calls "an agenda of values" that emphasize participatory, center, subjects and outcomes, consumers and producers of knowledge. expected of students. Within them students are the primary source and cratic, inquiring, interdisciplinary, and activist learning problem-posing, situated, multicultural, dialogic, desocializing, demo-Classroom instruction embodies and unfolds within a context of what taught, the instructional processes to be used, and the behavioral outcomes logical mandates as well as parameters for the substantive content to be Implicit in these conceptions of education for empowerment are ideo-

### Culturally Responsive Teaching Is Transformative

students, and it uses these as worthwhile resources for teaching and ences of African American, Native American, Latino, and Asian American several ways. It is very explicit about respecting the cultures and experitional practices with respect to ethnic students of color. This is done in For instance, the verbal creativity that is apparent among some African these students and then enhances them further in the instructional process. learning. It recognizes the existing strengths and accomplishments of Culturally responsive teaching defies conventions of traditional educa-

Americans in informal social interactions is recognized as a storytelling gift and used to teach them writing skills. This can be done by having the students verbalize their writing assignments, recording and transcribing them, and then teaching technical writing skills using the transcriptions of their own verbalized thoughts. The tendency of many Japanese, Chinese, and Filipino students to study together in small groups can be formalized in the classroom, providing more opportunities for them and other students to participate in cooperative learning.

Culturally responsive teaching makes academic success a non-negotiable mandate for all students and an accessible goal. It promotes the idea, and develops skills for practicing it, that students are obligated to be productive members of and render service to their respective ethnic communities as well as to the national society. It does not pit academic success and cultural affiliation against each other. Rather, academic success and cultural consciousness are developed simultaneously. Students are taught to be proud of their ethnic identities and cultural backgrounds instead of being apologetic or ashamed of them. Culturally responsive teaching also circumvents the tendency toward learned helplessness for some students of color in traditional public schools, where their achievement levels decrease the longer they remain in school (Holliday, 1985).

so that they can combat prejudices, racism, and other forms of oppression and exploitation. ness, intellectual critique, and political and personal efficacy in students instruction of traditional education. The other develops social conscioustural hegemony nested in much of the curriculum content and classroom focused. One direction deals with confronting and transcending the culthe transformative agenda of culturally responsive teaching is doubleschools, playgrounds, neighborhoods, and society at large. Therefore, these ethics and skills in different community contexts—classrooms, equality, justice, and power balances among ethnic groups. They practice for these, and become change agents committed to promoting greater inequities on different ethnic individuals and groups, have zero tolerance nomic action" (p. 131). Students must learn to analyze the effects of implement their decisions in effective personal, social, political, and econeeded to become social critics who can make reflective decisions and involves helping "students to develop the knowledge, skills, and values marginalized groups, it must be transformative. Being transformative proposed by J. Banks (1991). He contends that if education is to empower The features and functions of culturally responsive pedagogy meet the mandates of high-quality education for ethnically diverse students

# Culturally Responsive Teaching Is Emancipatory

and pride it generates are both psychologically and intellectually liberatman, 1994; M. Foster, 1995; Hollins, 1996; Hollins, King, & Hayman, 1994 thing to be continuously shared, critiqued, revised, and renewed (Chapnic, global, and human identities; and acceptance of knowledge as someunderstanding of interconnections among individual, local, national, eththinking; more caring, concerned, and humane interpersonal skills; better achievement of many kinds. Among them are more clear and insightful more thoroughly on academic learning tasks. The results are improved ing. This freedom allows students to focus more closely and concentrate different ethnic groups accessible to students. The validation, information, ing manacles of mainstream canons of knowledge and ways of knowing Erickson, 1987; Gordon, 1993; Lipman, 1995; Pewewardy, 1994; Philips, Culturally responsive pedagogy is liberating (Asante, 1991/1992; Au, 1993. Central to this kind of teaching is making authentic knowledge about Ladson-Billings, 1992, 1994, 1995a and 1995b; Lee, 1993; Lee & Slaughter-1983) in that it releases the intellect of students of color from the constrain-

Crichlow, Goodwin, Shakes, and Swartz (1990) provide another explanation for why education grounded in multiculturalism is emancipatory for teaching and learning. According to them, it

utilizes an inclusive and representational framework of knowledge in which students and teachers have the capacity to produce ventilated narratives.... By collectively representing diverse cultures and groups as producers of knowledge, it facilitates a liberative student/teacher relationship that "opens up" the written text and oral discourse to analysis and reconstruction. (p. 103)

In other words, culturally responsive pedagogy lifts the veil of presumed absolute authority from conceptions of scholarly truth typically taught in schools. It helps students realize that no single version of "truth" is total and permanent. Nor should it be allowed to exist uncontested. Students are taught how to apply new knowledge generated by various ethnic scholars to their analyses of social histories, issues, problems, and experiences. These learning engagements encourage and enable students to find their own voices, to contextualize issues in multiple cultural perspectives, to engage in more ways of knowing and thinking, and to become more active participants in shaping their own learning (Crichlow et al., 1990; J. King & Wilson, 1990; Ladson-Billings & Henry, 1990). These revela-

tions about knowledge and their attendant skills comprise the heart of the intellectual and cultural liberation facilitated by culturally responsive teaching. They are analogous to Freire's (1980) notions that critical conthem can be added that the freedom to be ethnically expressive removes the psychological stress associated with and psychic energy deployed in psychoemotional energy can be rechanneled into learning tasks, thereby improving intellectual attentiveness and academic achievement.

the students' cultural and communication styles into instructional pracnorms to structure and operate their classrooms, and they incorporated own cultural communities. They also drew on community patterns and edge, and skills for participating in the larger society as well as their American cultural community. They taught the students values, knowl-The teachers were personally affiliated with and connected to the African that these values and behaviors were demonstrated in their classrooms. of effective African American teachers, M. Foster (1989, 1994, 1995) found ity for helping each other achieve to the best of their ability. In her studies some winning and others losing, and for students to assume responsibiltional classrooms. The goal is for all students to be winners, rather than individualism and competitiveness that are so much a part of convenpendence, and reciprocity as criteria for guiding behavior replace the and are held accountable for one another's success. Mutual aid, interdeof culturally responsive teaching. Students are expected to work together Cooperation, community, and connectedness are also central features

# CULTURALLY RESPONSIVE TEACHING PERSONIFIED

Two stories are presented here to illustrate how the attributes of culturally responsive teaching operate in practice. Neither alone is a complete portrait. Each provides a capsule view of one or a few dimensions of this style of teaching. Together, they come closer to creating a complete picture. It is helpful to consider them both separately and together in visualizing so is consistent with a major feature of the paradigm itself—that is, the importance of dealing simultaneously with general issues and particular cases in teaching African American, Latino American, Asian American, critiquing and symboling.

#### Critiquing

The setting is a teacher education class. The students are studying the philosophical foundations of culturally responsive pedagogy. The principle under analysis is "K-12 education is a free, public, and equal access enterprise for all students in the United States." Students are expected to engage in critical, analytical, reflective, and transformative thinking about the issues, ideas, and assertions they encounter. The instructor invites them to "think about" what this principle means within the context of ethnic and cultural diversity. The students respond to this invitation as follows:

Student 1: What does "educational freedom" really mean for Native American students? If freedom means the right to learn without undue obstructions, how much freedom did they have when early missionary educators took them away from their families and communities, and forced them to "look" like European Americans, accept their religion, and ascribe to their values. Where is the freedom in this? And what about today? How unrestricted are the opportunities for Native Americans to learn, practice, and celebrate their cultural heritages in modern schools?

Student 3: It seems to me that public education as the "great equalizer" Student 2: I'm concerned about Filipinos and other immigrant or firstand cultural diversity fit into the equal opportunity equation? and "equalizing opportunities"? Where do bi- or multilingualism ment level? What is the connection between "freedom to learn dering, What about the possibility of loss of language? How might to speak English." I'm not opposed to this, but I am still left woneducational mastery comparable to children who are competent in guage system that is alien to them. Do they have opportunities for other languages, and these students have to try to function in a lanschools don't speak Tagalog, Thai, Cambodian, Spanish, or some generation U. S.-born students who may not be fluent in English. this loss affect students' cultural affiliation and sense of identity? "these children are now in the United States and they must learn the language of instruction? People may say, as they often do, that portunities mean for them? Where is the equality when teachers in How does having to learn in an unfamiliar language affect achieve-What does freedom to learn and the right to equal educational op-

really meant Anglicizing all students from non-European origins. I

think schools have done much more to homogenize culturally di-

verse students than to make the educational experience a true amalgamation of contributions from all the different ethnic groups and cultures that make up the United States. If this had happened years ago, there would be no grounds for current appeals for ethnic studies, women's studies, multicultural education, and bilingualism to be included in school programs.

Student 4: I don't think there is much equality in never seeing your own ethnic group's contributions represented in textbooks, or having them depicted in biased and stereotypical ways. Imagine what that they are descendants of slaves, chattel, unintelligent buffoons, who were treated almost like animals. Or Native Americans being that matter, the ego inflation potential of the notion of "manifest moved from educational freedom and equality. They sound more diverse ethnic backgrounds perform to the best of their intellectual thident for the conditions? I think not.

Student 5: The whole idea is a hustle, a myth. Education has never been free and equal in this country. Children who have the least have always had to make the greatest sacrifices, pay the highest prices, and get the lowest benefits. Look at the desegregation expertion of city schools compared to suburban ones. Where are the best teachers assigned? The best buildings and materials? The best proequality had existed from the beginning, we would not have the kind of achievement disparities we currently have.

Student 6: I think we need to take a closer look at who came up with these ideas, and what did they mean by them. Their conceptions probably were quite different from ours. If we knew this, we would be better able to make better sense of them conceptually, and decide whether to continue to accept them on blind faith or to revise them so that they are more appropriate for today's realities. I guess I am proposing here that we do what one of my other professors means by "positionality analyses."

Student 7: (Laughing in response to the comments made by Student 6) Girl, we know who they be. They most definitely ain't us. If we had made glib statements like that, you wouldn't be wondering what we meant, 'cause we would have told you explicitly and up front what was what.

Several other students: Uh, huh (and other signs of endorsement of Student 7's comments)

Instructor: This is good. You are questioning, critiquing, deconstructing, evoking a variety of points of reference, seeking out specific cultural grounding of applicability of general pedagogical ideas.

Continue to "think about."

#### Symboling

The kindergarten class Lois teaches is comprised of immigrant and first-generation U. S. students from many countries, as well as a mixture of different native ethnic groups. Consequently, there is a lot of ethnic, racial, cultural, and linguistic diversity present. Looking into her classroom provides a glimpse of how culturally responsive teaching can be accomplished through the use of visual imagery and symbols. The school year has been in session for a little more than 4 months. Lois has established other's cultural diversity. As we take a quick tour of this classroom, we witness the following:

with the children's own art. The sign reads "Welcome to Our Academic ally diverse images. Maps of the world and the United States are promibers of the class and "welcome" in different languages (Spanish, Japanese, Attached to the entrance door is a huge welcome sign brightly decorated doctors, construction workers, dancers). rites of passage (e.g., marriage, adulthood, baptism) and occupations (clergy tures of adults from different ethnic groups in ceremonial dress for various cial photographs of the members of the class. These are surrounded by picis labeled "Our Many Different Faces." It includes a montage of close-up fagroups of the students in the class. A display in another comer of the room States. They represent the countries of origin of the families and/or ethnic Many Places." Strings connect different parts of the world to the United nently displayed on the front wall, under the heading "We Come from is bombarded with an incredibly rich and wide range of ethnically and cultur-German, French, various U. S. dialects, etc.). Stepping inside the room, one Home." This message is accompanied by a group photograph of the mem-

The room's "Reading Center" is a prototype of multicultural children's literature—a culturally responsive librarian's dream! Many different ethnic groups, topics, and literary types are included. Books, poems, comics, song lyrics, posters, magazines, and newspapers beckon the students to discover and read about the histories, families, myths, folktales, travels, troubles, triumphs, experiences, and daily lives of a wide variety of Asian, African, Euro

<u>4</u>

with the credit line "Donated by the Kindergarten Class of Room. attached to the gifts. The recipients must agree to acknowledge the donors items they will keep and which they will give away. Only one stipulation is community agencies. This is a class project, with the students deciding which dents "outgrow it," some of the items are donated to the school library or comes too large to be easily accommodated in the classroom, or the stuhaving each item stamped "Donated by \_ leam about in school. The families are given credit for their contributions by they either use with their children at home or would like their children to about their own ethnic group and the other about some other group that other forms of media to the class collection. One of these books is to be of the students to make a contractual agreement to donate two books or complishment. At the beginning of the academic year, she gets the parents tion, "Lois, how did you come by all of this?" She credits parents for the ac-The extent and quality of this collection of materials prompt the ques-- Elementary School." -." When the collection be-

Lois is a strong believer in "representative ethnic imagery." She is very conscientious about ensuring that the visual depictions of ethnic groups and individuals in her classroom are accurate, authentic, and pluralistic. She explains that she wants students to readily recognize who the ethnic visuals represent rather than having to wonder what they are supposed to be. She also wants the students to be exposed to a wide variety of images within and among groups to avoid ethnic stereotyping. To assist the students with this identification, all of the pictures of ethnic individuals displayed throughout the classroom include personal and ethnic identities. These read, "My name is \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ I am \_\_\_\_\_\_ [ethnic group]. Lois justifies this protocol by simply saying, "Students need to know that it's OK to recognize other people's ethnicity and to expect others to acknowledge theirs. Ethnicity is an important feature of our personal identities."

Two other permanent culturally pluralistic displays exist in this stimulating, intellectually invigorating, and culturally diverse classroom. One is entitled "We Can Do Many Things." Here are images, samples, and symbols of the contributions and accomplishments of different ethnic groups, such as crafts, arts, science, technology, medicine, and music. They include children

and adults of different ages, famous and common folks, profound achievements and regular, daily occurrences. For example, there is one photograph of three students who have been especially helpful to classmates from other ethnic groups and another of six great-grandparents who are 75 years of age or older. The master tape representing different ethnic groups' contributions to music includes excerpts from operas, jazz, rap, spirituals, movie sound tracks, country, pop, and children's songs. The names of other individuals are accompanied by miniature samples of their contributions. There is the athlete with a little basketball, but it's refreshing to see that she is a member of the 1996 U. S. Olympic team, and Venus and Serena are there with their little tennis rackets. Some kernels of com appear next to Native Americans, and a little make-believe heart operation kit is connected to African Americans.

The other permanent display is a multicultural alphabet streamer. Differ ent ethnic groups and contributions are associated with each of the letters in the alphabet. For example, "Jamaican" and "Japanese American," as well as "Jazz" appear under the letter J, and "lasso" and "Latino" appear under L.

The tour of this classroom also offers a glimpse into how Lois incorporates the ethnically diverse symbols into her formal instruction. Small groups of students are working on different skills. As Lois circulates among them, activities in the reading and math groups are riveting. It is Carlos's turn to select the book to be read for storytime. He chooses one about a Japanese American family. Lois asks him to tell the group why he made this choice. Carlos explains that he had seen Yukiko (a classmate) at McDonald's over the weekend, and he wanted to do something nice for her by reading "her" book. He also said he saw some other people like those in the book, and he wanted to know more about them because they don't look like people where he lives.

Before Lois begins to read the story, she tells the students a little about this ethnic group, like the proper name, its country of origin, some symbol of its culture (they eat a lot of different kinds of noodles), and where large numbers of its members live in the United States. She asks if anyone can find Japan and California on the maps. She helps the group locate these places. As the students return to their places and settle down for the story, we hear Lois asking, "If we wanted to go to the places where there are a lot of Japanese Americans, how would we get there? Who would like to go?" Several hands pop up quickly at the thought of such an imagined journey. Incidentally (maybe not!), the book Carlos chose to read is about a little boy taking his first airplane ride with his parents to go visit his grandparents, who live far away. Once this "context setting" is completed, Lois proceeds through a dialogic reading of the book. She pauses frequently to probe the students' understanding of associated meaning prompted by the

ments in the story. narrative text, to examine their feelings, and to predict upcoming develop-

tape, using a motif similar to "Sesame Street." native Spanish speaker counting. This is presented in the form of a videothis is done, the students are asked to sit quietly, listen, and observe another and the other students are to practice saying the words as she does. After of the group, she agrees. Lois tells the group that Rosita is now the teacher would like to give it a try. After a little encouragement from other members tion, "I bet she can say those words real good." Lois asks Rosita if she everyone that Rosita speaks Spanish at home and announces, with convicothers say them aloud. After some giggling and gentle consternation about language do not sound like those who are native speakers. Tamika reminds ing with their concerns and reminding them that people who are learning a their pronunciation, Lois compliments the students' efforts, while sympathiz-Spanish words for the numbers. One student points to the words as the priate word. On this occasion, they are learning to count to 10 in Spanish. Under Lois's supervision, the students go through an oral exercise using the know how to count in English and to associate the number with the appro-In math, the students are practicing bilingual counting. They already

climate, in which the use of culturally diverse referents in teaching and invited to extend the boundaries of their knowledge and skills. All of own and one another's identities and abilities, while simultaneously being with ethnic and cultural diversity. They learn about and celebrate their levels of many different kinds of achievement for students from all ethnic learning is habitual. This type of instruction is very conducive to high this occurs in a warm, supportive, affirming, and illuminating classroom attests. Her students are inundated with positive images and interactions Symbols are powerful conveyers of meaning, as Lois's classroom

## ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF TEACHERS

atmospheres that radiate cultural and ethnic diversity, and facilitate high stand how culture operates in daily classroom dynamics, create learning the single role of cultural broker. As cultural organizers, teachers must underfor learning. Gentemann and Whitehead (1983) combined these tasks into ries: cultural organizers, cultural mediators, and orchestrators of social contexts responsive pedagogy are some key roles and responsibilities for teachers. Diamond and Moore (1995) have organized them into three major catego-Implicit in these mandates, attributes, and personifications of culturally

> academic achievement for all students. Opportunities must be provided rated into teaching and learning processes on a regular basis. These accomcultural expression so that their voices and experiences can be incorpofor students from different ethnic backgrounds to have free personal and modations require the use of various culturally centered ways of knowing,

thinking, speaking, feeling, and behaving.

engage in critical dialogue about conflicts among cultures and to analyze success, where empowerment replaces powerlessness and oppression. celebrate and affirm each other and work collaboratively for their mutual relationships, and avoid perpetuating prejudices, stereotypes, and racism. ties, honor other cultures, develop positive cross-ethnic and cross-cultural different cultural systems. They help students clarify their ethnic identiinconsistencies between mainstream cultural ideals/realities and those of The goal is to create communities of culturally diverse learners who As cultural mediators, teachers provide opportunities for students to

of ethnically diverse students. They also help students translate their nition of a cultural frame of reference can be helpful in achieving these cultural competencies into school learning resources. Spring's (1995) deficesses compatible with the sociocultural contexts and frames of reference the important influence culture has on learning and make teaching procause a cultural group to interpret the world . . . in a particular manner" knowledge of the outside world are ordered and made meaningful. (p. 5), or the filter through which impressions of, experiences with, and teaching-learning synchronizations. He defines it as "those elements that As orchestrators of social contexts for learning, teachers must recognize

#### CONCLUSION

caring. It uses ways of knowing, understanding, and representing various tural affirmation, competence, and exchange; community building and along with academic achievement, social consciousness and critique, cul-To recapitulate, culturally responsive pedagogy simultaneously develops, skills. It cultivates cooperation, collaboration, reciprocity, and mutual ethnic and cultural groups in teaching academic subjects, processes, and personal connections; individual self-worth and abilities; and an ethic of different ethnic groups into all subjects and skills taught. teachers. It incorporates high-status, accurate cultural knowledge about responsibility for learning among students and between students and

dignity and intellectual capabilities of their students. They view learning as having intellectual, academic, personal, social, ethical, and political Culturally responsive teachers have unequivocal faith in the human

dimensions, all of which are developed in concert with one another. They of ethnically diverse students and the curriculum content of academic subjects to facilitate higher levels of learning. These teachers use a variety lum, instruction, and assessment, embedded in multicultural contexts ment as central to the acquisition and demonstration of learning. Acaof all participants in the teaching-learning process. In their interpersonal portive, personable, enthusiastic, understanding, and flexible (Shade, performance from both themselves and their students.

Thus, culturally responsive pedagogy validates, facilitates, liberates, and empowers ethnically diverse students by simultaneously cultivating their cultural integrity, individual abilities, and academic success. It is expectations, cultural communication in the classroom, culturally diverse content in the curriculum, and culturally congruent instructional strategies.

dren will have more successful stories to tell about their learning encoun-1, will be historical memories, not everyday occurrences, and their chilschooling experiences like those of Amy and Aaron, described in Chapter dren who are currently underachieving in schools. Hopefully, then, ters and academic achievement. relentlessly pursue comprehensive and high-level performance for chilabout cultural diversity into pedagogical practices; and (5) the tenacity to (4) the skills to act productively in translating knowledge and sensitivity tions of cultural universality and/or neutrality in teaching and learning; educational canons and convictions, and to rethink traditional assumpwrong with existing educational systems; (3) the will to confront prevailing achievements of different ethnic groups; (2) the courage to stop blaming the victims of school failure and to admit that something is seriously the cultural values, learning styles, historical legacies, contributions, and ing personnel. It requires teachers who have (1) thorough knowledge about in the professional development, accountability, and assessment of teachthen widespread instructional reform is needed, as well as major changes If the potential of culturally responsive pedagogy is to be realized,

#### CHAPTER 3

### The Power of Caring

She routinely begins her classes with declarations to the effect that "I believe in collaborative teaching and successful learning for all students. This course is designed to ensure these. We are going to work hard; we are going to have fun doing it; and we are going to do it together. I am very good at what I do, and since you are going to be working in partnership with me, you are going to be good, too. In fact, as my students, you have no choice but to be good." These declarations are at once a promise and a mandate, an ethic and an action. They set in motion an esprit de corps, an ambiance, an instructional style, a set of expectations that are directed toward high-level student achievement. The message intended for students is "I have faith in your ability to learn, I care about the quality of your learning, and I commit myself to making sure that you will learn."

#### INTRODUCTION

These declarations set the tone and contours for the discussions of caring presented in this chapter. They also meet Webb, Wilson, Corbett and Mordecai's (1993) criteria that caring is a value and a moral imperative that moves "self-determination into social responsibility and uses knowledge and strategic thinking to decide how to act in the best interests of others. Caring binds individuals to their society, to their communities, and to each other" (pp. 33–34). The interest of concern here is improved achievement, and the "community" is underachieving students of colors and their teachers.

This kind of caring is one of the major pillars of culturally responsive pedagogy for ethnically diverse students. It is manifested in the form of teacher attitudes, expectations, and behaviors about students' human value, intellectual capability, and performance responsibilities. Teachers demonstrate caring for children as *students* and as *people*. This is expressed in concern for their psychoemotional well-being and academic success; personal morality and social actions; obligations and celebrations; commu-