Pros and Cons of Texts and Elicitation

Edith Aldridge

UW Linguistics
Seediq (Austronesian, Atayalic)  
Nantou Prefecture, Central Taiwan

- Case marking: Ergative-Absolutive
- Basic word order: VOS
  - \( \Rightarrow [V \ldots ] \text{Abs} \)
  - \( \Rightarrow (N_{Top}) [V \ldots ] N_{Abs} (N_{Top}) \)
- Syntax: Split-ergative
  - \( \Rightarrow \) Transitive antipassive construction
  - \( \Rightarrow \) Low transitive ergative construction
Communication Limitations

Unreliable explanations
Genitive pronoun
(Explained as ‘politeness’ 禮貌)

- kobusuran-ni: wada beebu
- older.sibling-Def Past hit
- suwai=na
- younger.sibling=3.Gen
- ‘Older brother hit his younger brother.’
Ergative pronoun
(Explained as aspect marker 好了)

- wada(=na) burig-un (na Pawan)
- Past(=3s.Erg) buy-Tr Erg Pawan
- ka patis
- Abs book
Problems with Elicitation

1. Calques
Japanese adverbial clause
subordinator *tokoro* ‘place’

- Pawan=ga sake=o nonde-iru
- Pawan=Nom wine=Acc drink-be
- tokoro=o mikaketa.
- place=Acc saw
- ‘I saw Pawan drinking wine.’
Translation of *tokoro* as noun

- wada=mu sterun numah-an
- Past=1s.Erg meet drink-App
- sino hiya ka Pawan
- wine there Abs Pawan
- ‘I met Pawan there at the place where one drinks wine.’
Re-elicitation with *toki* ‘time, when’

- Pawan=ni [sake=о  nonde-iru
- Pawan=Dat  wine=Acc  drink-be
- toki-ni] deatta.
- place=Acc  met
- ‘I when Pawan when he was drinking wine.’
Targeted response

- wada=mu sterun munimah
- Past=1s.Erg meet drink
- sino hiya ka Pawan
- wine there Abs Pawan
- ‘I saw met Pawan drinking wine there.’
Problems with Elicitation

2. Missed surprises
Transitivity Marking

• kika ha-*un m-ari so
• then go-Tr Intr-sell ??
•olumukan
• Chinese
• ‘Then (we) go sell (them) to the Chinese.’
Something new

- tmekan **kes-un** tukanan qushia
- pound say-Tr grinder water
- chiida=na pae
- time=3s.Gen rice
- ‘In those days, (we) milled rice with was is called a “water grinder”.’
Lexical Item (Text)

- mehedu pututing kandalax bubu=na
- finish drop from mother=3.Gen
- Ka hei=na de
- Abs fruit=3.Gen Asp
- ‘having finished knocking the fruit from the tree’
Something unexpected

- rima  
- bale  
- kubekui

- 5  
- really  
- 100

- ‘as much as 500’
Problems with Texts

1. Controlling for word order
Ergative Clitic (Text)

• Gaga=ku=daha ngal-un
• Pres=1s.Abs=3.Pl take-Tr
• ka yaku duri.
• Abs 1s also
• ‘The have accepted me also.’
Full Ergative NP (Elicited)

- wada  burig-un  na  Ape  ka  patis
- Past  buy-Tr  Erg  Ape  Abs  book
- ‘Ape bought the book.’

- wada  s-bege  hulama  na  Ape
- Past  App-give  treat  Erg  Ape
- ka  laqi
- Abs  child
- ‘Ape gave the child a treat.’
Relative Clause (Text)

• [mah-un=daha so] wisupi
• drink-Tr=3.Pl ?? wisupi
• ‘wisupi that they were drinking’
IHRC (Elicited)

• [s<n>malu sapah na Pawan]
• <Perf>make house Erg Pawan
• ‘house that Pawan built’
Problems with texts

2. Translation effects in texts
Mixture of lexical and functional items from Japanese

• Ashika  *shigatsu kara*
• *must.be April from*
• betaq  *gogatsu made*
• *until May until*
• ‘It has to be from April to May.’
Loan verb

- uxe=miyan *dekiru* p-puyas laqi
- not=1p.Excl can Caus-studychild
- ‘We would not have been able to send our kids to school.’
Both nouns and verbs

- *daisamban* dahaka *daiyomban=na*
- #3 and #4=3s.Gen
- *supu-un=mu* *kekkon* muntena ali
- Together-Tr=1s.Erg marry same day
- ‘(Sons) number three and number four, I married them (off) on the same day.’
Language influence on speaker’s attention

• gisu  meyah  lumjeku  hini
• Pres  come  mountain  here
• ka  seito  tanax  tunux
• Abs  student  red  head
• ‘A Japanese student has come here to the mountains.’