

schools. Through occasional grants and privileges, government had customarily extended this kind of aid as far back as pre-Reformation England. Far from seeing a conflict between church and state, the Council reinforced this tradition of aiding churches to educate the poor. There was no establishment and no favoritism; all denominations shared alike. However, the decision also reinforced an association of state intervention in education with charity to the poor. While the Regents assisted colleges and academies that were too expensive for all but the wealthy (at least as far as New York City was concerned), the city aided common education only for those too poor to pay. Both policies tended to increase segregation of education on class lines in the city as the nineteenth century progressed and made it difficult for the free schools aided by the city to become a truly common school system. What was settled in the years 1795 to 1800 was that a common school system in New York City would evolve from the free charity schools and not from the common pay schools.

Thus, the familiar complaint heard later in the nineteenth century, that the public schools were looked upon as charity schools, was not simply a result of the refusal of wealthy people to patronize them, but was also a result of decisions such as that of the New York Common Council in 1796, to devote common school funds only to charity schools, according to received tradition. Meanwhile, the role of the independent school, which thrived during the 1790s, providing inexpensive schooling for perhaps more than half of the city's children, was transformed during the nineteenth century. Hundreds of thousands of resourceless and exploited immigrants swelled the poor neighborhoods of the city, and reformers attempted to reach them through a massive extension of the charity school system. Independent schools gradually become more expensive, more exclusive, and less central in the city's educational life.

TABLE 1
Occupational Categories in the 1796 Directory

Category	Explanation	Number	Percent of Sample
Laborer	Includes porter, stoker, and stevedore.	56	5.5
Mariner	Includes boatman, excludes captain.	38	3.7
Cartman	Includes coachman.	93	9.5
Skilled Craftsman	All crafts. Includes rigger, printer.	443	43.1
Clerical Worker	Clerk, accountant; includes inspector, measurer.	21	2.0
Proprietor	Grocer; tavern, boardinghouse, and stable keeper. Includes brewer, tobacconist.	147	14.3
Professional	Doctor, lawyer, minister.	41	4.0
Merchant	Includes broker, warehouse, and shipyard owner.	133	13.0
Others	No clear category; e.g., ship captain (17), teacher (4), gardener (4), cigar manufacturer (3), dairymen (3).	55	5.4
Total		1,027	100

Total
Source: Men whose last names begin with A and B in Low's New York Directory for 1796 (pp. 1-28).

TABLE 2
New York State Census of Electors and Inhabitants,
City and County of New York, 1790

Ward	Freeholders at 1700			Freeholders at 1720			Tenants at 40 s.			Freeman			Total Electors			Population			
	No.	%		No.	%		No.	%		No.	%		No.	%		Female	Male	Slaves	Total
North	173	3.8	174	3.8	528	11.5	0	0	875	19.0	2,001	2,333	264	4,598					
West	152	2.5	151	2.4	479	7.8	0	0.1	789	12.8	2,777	3,089	303	6,169					
Dock	86	4.7	82	4.5	147	8.0	0	0	315	17.0	793	813	248	1,854					
East	225	6.2	200	5.5	350	9.7	1	0	776	21.4	1,572	1,567	488	3,627					
South	11	0.5	54	3.1	253	14.4	19	1.1	337	19.2	797	845	114	1,756					
Montgomery	308	4.6	304	4.5	584	8.7	3	0	1,199	16.0	3,056	3,215	427	6,698					
Cut	214	4.4	215	4.5	289	6.0	63	1.3	781	12.2	2,141	2,374	304	4,819					
Hellam	40	8.0	41	8.2	31	6.2	0	0	112	22.4	193	193	115	487					
Total	1,209	4.0	1,221	4.1	2,661	8.9	93	0.3	5,184	17.3	13,330	14,429	2,203	30,022					

Sources: Advertiser, January 15, 1791; Heads of Families at the First Census of the United States (Washington, 1908).

Winter 1972 487
"Common Schools Before
Tables 1-9 from Carl Kaestle, "Common Schools Before
The Common School Revival," History of Education
P. 110-111
12 (Winter, 1972): 487-494.

TABLE 4 - Continued

Nathaniel Mead
 16 to 20s
 Richard Patterson
 16 to 24s
 John Roe
 \$2 to \$3
 George Youngs
 16 to 40s
 Benjamin Romaine
 24 to 28s

£ = \$2.50
 s = shillings
 Source: Teachers' Reports to the Common Council, NYMA.

TABLE 5
 Profile of Dutch Charity School Students, 1796^a

Student's Name	Father's Occupation	Tax Assessment (£)		Whites			Other	Religion	Age April 1, 1796	Basis of Parental Identification	Time of School Admitted
		Real	sonel	16+	Male	Female					
Armstrong, Elizabeth	Laborer	0	0	6	-	-	-	(All assumed to be Dutch)	13	Baptism	'92 '96
Deacon, James	(Mother: nurse)	0	0	1	0	1	3	0	0	Dunstable	'92 '98
Covenhoven, Nicholas	Cartman	0	0	6	1	3	4	0	0	Dunstable	'92 '96
Romaine, Ob	Cartman	200	0	7	2	4	2	0	0	Dunstable	'92 '96
Vanck, Catherine	Taylor	0	0	7	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Van Benschoten,		0	0	7	0	0	2	0	0	Dunstable	'92 '96
Cornelius	Cartman	0	0	6	1	0	7	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '97
Morris, Rachel	Cartman	0	0	6	1	0	7	0	0	Dunstable	'93 '97
Morris, Susan	(Mother: mantua maker)	0	0	4	-	-	-	-	-	Baptism	'94 '96
Lyon, Michael	Cartman	250	30	4	2	3	4	0	0	Baptism	'94 '99
Stigg, John	Cartman	0	0	6	1	1	2	0	0	Dunstable	'94 '95
Ackerman, Lawrence	Grocer	0	0	7	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'94 '99
Decker, John	Potter	0	0	6	-	-	-	-	8	Baptism	'95 '98
(Mother: seamstress)		0	0	6	1	0	3	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '98
Colbert, John	Cartman	0	0	4	1	2	1	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '98
Rykeman, Mary	Cartman	0	50	6	1	2	3	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '98
Emmett, George	Cartman	0	50	6	1	2	3	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '98
Measuror	Measuror	0	20	3	3	1	5	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '98
Stidell, Nicholas	Shoemaker	0	20	3	3	1	5	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '98
Wandell, Catherine	Shoemaker	0	0	1	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '97
Wandell, Mary	Shoemaker	0	0	1	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '97
Skerts, Harmon	(Guardian: Widow Kip)	0	0	3	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '96
Smith, Edward	Cartman (Guardian)	100	0	7	1	1	3	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '97
Acker, Laney	Cartman (Guardian)	100	0	7	1	1	3	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '96
Andrew, Andrew	Andrew	0	0	6	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '96
Acker, Rachel	Blacksmith	0	0	3	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '97
Ayers, Daniel	Blacksmith	0	0	3	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '96
Ayers, Tobias	Blacksmith	0	0	3	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '96
Penny, John	Pilot	0	0	6	1	2	1	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '97
King, Jacob	Cartman	150	0	6	1	4	3	0	0	Dunstable	'96 '01
Klarsted, James	Brass Founder	0	50	2	2	2	3	0	0	Dunstable	'96 '01
Mead, John	Tavernkeeper	0	50	2	2	2	3	0	0	Baptism	'95 '99
Mead, Mary	Tavernkeeper	0	50	5	2	3	3	0	0	Dunstable	'95 '98
Amerman, Isaac	Cartman	0	50	5	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '96
Nicholas, Henry	Blacksmith	0	0	6	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '96
None: Almshouse		0	0	4	1	2	2	0	0	Dunstable	'96 '99
Van Dyke, Charles	None given	0	0	4	1	2	2	0	0	Dunstable	'96 '99
Deklyn, Peg	Cartman	200	50	6	2	2	2	0	0	Dunstable	'96 '95
Miner, James	Cartman	200	0	6	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '95
Ver Valen, Andrew	Cartman	0	50	6	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '97
Lang, Daniel	Shoemaker	200	50	1	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '97
Devok, Laney	Wood Inspector	200	50	1	-	-	-	-	-	Dunstable	'95 '97

^aTotal enrollment, 101; parents identified, 32; sibling pairs, 5; children of parents identified, 37.

TABLE 3

Financial Status of New York City Teachers, 1796

Tax assessments	N = 91	
	Men	Women
No listing	26	30
Renters, personal property valued at:		
£ 20 - 25	5	0
£ 26 - 50	16	0
£ 51 - 100	4	0
House owners	9	1
	60	31

Name	Ward	Real and Personal Property
House-owning teachers enumerated		
John Collins	5	\$ 250
Daniel Smith	5	300
John West	Bowery	300
Malcolm Campbell	4	400
Treat Crane	1	450
John Campbell	1	500
Samuel Van Steenburgh	2	600
Gerard Smith	1	700
Benjamin Romaine	4	1,750
Mrs. Mary Henshaw	3	1,800

TABLE 4
 Tuition Charges for Common Pay Schools, 1796

Per Quarter
16s
14 to 20s
14 to 20s
\$1 to \$2
20 to 24s
20 to 24s
20 to 24s
20 to 24s
22 to 24s
22 to 24s
16 to 20s
14 to 18s

William Gum
 Daniel Smith
 Robert Piggot
 Christopher Peter
 George Bement
 Carrol and O'Hagarty
 John Collins
 Martin Evans
 Donald Fraser
 James Gibbons
 James Liddel

Total		Reported (partial): 1,518	Estimated (total): 5,249
Almshouse School		Enrollment: 60	60 students
Pay Schools, Women	No reports extant		20 students, estimate x 31 women teachers 620 estimated pay school enrollment,
	Average: 69	1,008	164
Bemets	98	0	
Gumm	31	0	
Smith, D.	20	8	
Piggot	50	0	
Peter	55	0	
Rudd	25	0	

TABLE 8 - Continued

Total Estimated School Enrollment, 1795-1796 (excludes college, dancing, and music students)		Reported (partial)		Estimated (total)	
Charity Schools		51	86	71.5 students per school	x 6 charity schools
African Free		51	86	71.5 students per school	
Trinity Charity		86	86		
Presb. Charity		69	80		
Dutch Charity		80	286	429.0 estimated charity school enrollment	
Average: 71.5					
Pay Schools, Men		40 day	83	69 students per school	x 60 men teachers
Carroll	40 day	83	41	69 students per school	
Collins		83	41		
Evans		48	24	4,140 estimated pay school enrollment,	
Fraser		96	0		
Gibbons		66	0		men teachers
Liddell		61	8		
Mead		49	30		
Patterson		63	12		
Roe		60	0		
Romaine		107	0		
Youngs		56	41		

TABLE 8

TABLE 9

Occupations of School Children's Parents, 1796
Includes both charity and pay school parents.
See Table 1 for explanation of categories.

Category	Number of Parents	% of School Parents	Directory Sample (Table 1)
Laborer	4	2.4	5.5
Mariner	8	4.8	3.7
Cartman	21	12.5	9.5
Skilled trades	66	39.5	43.1
Clerical	10	6.0	2.0
Proprietor	31	18.5	14.3
Professional	0	0	4.0
Merchant	13	7.8	13.0
Other	14	8.4	5.4
Total	167	100	100

No occupation listed: 21 (omitted from Table 1 computations).

Notes

1. See also Bernard Bailyn, *Education in the Forming of American Society* (Chapel Hill, 1960), and Lawrence A. Cremin, *American Education: The Colonial Experience, 1607-1783* (New York, 1970).
2. Kaestle, *The Evolution of an Urban School System*, chaps. 3-6; see also, Michael B. Katz, *The Irony of Early School Reform: Educational Innovation in Mid-Nineteenth Century Massachusetts* (Cambridge, Mass., 1968); Stanley K. Schultz, "The Education of Urban Americans: Boston, 1789-1860", (Ph.D. diss., University of Chicago, 1969); Raymond A. Mohl, "Education as Social Control in New York City, 1784-1785," *New York History* 61 (Spring 1970): 219-37.
3. *New York Daily Advertiser*, January 13, 1791, cited in Sidney I. Pomerantz, *New York, an American City, 1783-1803*, 2d ed. (New York, 1965), p. 216; on the economics of the 1780s, see E. Wilder Spaulding, *New York in the Critical Period, 1783-1789* (New York, 1932), pp. 28-29.
4. Pomerantz, *New York*, p. 216; Kenneth Roberts and Anna M. Roberts, eds., *Moreau de St. Méry's American Journey, 1793-1798* (New York, 1947), pp. 157-60. These sources imply that the wage increase represented increases in real income.

5. On commodity prices, see Moreau, *Journey*, pp. 157-60; on rents, see James G. Wilson, *The Memorial History of the City of New York* (New York, 1893), 2:21, and Pomerantz, *New York*, pp. 169, 227-28. The best proof that workmen could afford school tuition is that so many of them in fact appear in the pay school lists analyzed below.
6. See Paul H. Douglass, *American Apprenticeship and Industrial Education* (New York, 1921); Samuel McKee, Jr., *Labor in Colonial New York* (New York, 1935); Richard B. Morris, *Government and Labor in Early America* (New York, 1946). Douglass wrote that apprenticeship was unchanged after the Revolution and began to decline with industrialization after the War of 1812, while McKee (p. 62f.) saw signs of decline before the Revolution, and Morris (p. 200) says the system began to decline at the close of the Revolution. There are no figures available to document any of these contentions, but impressionistic evidence, such as is presented here, indicates that while apprenticeship may have begun to "decline," it had not, by any means, "declined."
7. New York City Almshouse Commissioners, *Apprentice Indentures, 1792-1794*, New-York Historical Society (hereafter cited as NYHS). By 1850, in contrast, there was less demand for craft apprentices in the city and a trend toward exporting the children. In 1850-1851, 58 of 108 poor children were sent away to become farmers, and 21 more were bound to craftsmen outside New York City. New York City Apprentice Indentures, Boys, 1850-1853, NYHS.
8. The assumption that city directories underrepresent common laborers and especially mariners is probably correct, although the directories of the late 1790s seem to be more inclusive than the first efforts of the 1780s or the later nineteenth-century directories. Low's *Directory for 1796* contains approximately 10,100 entries, of which approximately 1,900 are female household heads or redundant firm names, leaving 8,200 male adult entries. The estimated population for 1795 is 46,397 (see note 27 below), of which about 25 percent, or 11,579, were white males over 16. This would yield an inclusion percentage of 70.8 percent. However, the male adult figure (based on the percentage in the 1800 Census, 25.3 percent) is for whites, whereas the Directory included some black household heads. This would make the inclusion figure too high, perhaps by 5 percent. On the other hand, and more importantly, many men between 16 and 21, or even older, were apprentices or still lived with their families and thus would not appear in the *Directory* as heads of households. This would more than compensate for the omis-